

# NuFIT 2.1: Three-neutrino fit based on data available in May 2016

---

Ivan Esteban,<sup>a</sup> M. C. Gonzalez-Garcia,<sup>a,b,c</sup> Michele Maltoni,<sup>d</sup> Ivan Martinez-Soler,<sup>d</sup>  
Thomas Schwetz<sup>e</sup>

<sup>a</sup>*Departament d'Estructura i Constituents de la Matèria and Institut de Ciències del Cosmos, Universitat de Barcelona, Diagonal 647, E-08028 Barcelona, Spain*

<sup>b</sup>*Institució Catalana de Recerca i Estudis Avançats (ICREA), Spain*

<sup>c</sup>*C.N. Yang Institute for Theoretical Physics, State University of New York at Stony Brook, Stony Brook, NY 11794-3840, USA*

<sup>d</sup>*Instituto de Física Teórica UAM/CSIC, Calle de Nicolás Cabrera 13-15, Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, Cantoblanco, E-28049 Madrid, Spain*

<sup>e</sup>*Institut für Kernphysik, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology (KIT), 76021 Karlsruhe, Germany*

*E-mail:* [ivan.esteban@ecm.ub.edu](mailto:ivan.esteban@ecm.ub.edu), [concha@insti.physics.sunysb.edu](mailto:concha@insti.physics.sunysb.edu),  
[michele.maltoni@csic.es](mailto:michele.maltoni@csic.es), [ivanj.m@csic.es](mailto:ivanj.m@csic.es), [schwetz@kit.edu](mailto:schwetz@kit.edu)

---

ABSTRACT: We present updated results for our global analysis of solar, atmospheric, reactor, and accelerator neutrino data in the framework of three-neutrino oscillations. We perform two independent analyses, which we denote as “LEM” or “LID” according to which of the two alternative  $\nu_e$ -appearance data samples released by the NO $\nu$ A collaboration is used. We also provide  $\chi^2$  tables for the various one- and two-dimensional projections of the global analysis. If you use these results, please refer to both [1] and [2]. Data sets which have been updated with respect to NuFIT 2.0 are marked by the “ $\Rightarrow$ ” tag.

## Solar experiments

- Chlorine total rate [3], 1 data point.
- Gallex & GNO total rates [4], 2 data points.
- SAGE total rate [5], 1 data point.
- SK1 full energy and zenith spectrum [6], 44 data points.
- SK2 full energy and day/night spectrum [7], 33 data points.
- SK3 full energy and day/night spectrum [8], 42 data points.
- $\Rightarrow$  SK4 2055-day energy and day/night spectrum [9], 46 data points.
- SNO combined analysis [10], 7 data points.
- Borexino Phase-I 740.7-day low-energy data [11], 33 data points.
- Borexino Phase-I 246-day high-energy data [12], 6 data points.
- $\Rightarrow$  Borexino Phase-II 408-day low-energy data [13], 42 data points.

## Atmospheric experiments

- SK1–4 (including SK4 1775-day) combined data [14], 70 data points.
- ⇒ IceCube/DeepCore 3-year data [15, 16], 64 data points.

## Reactor experiments

- KamLAND combined DS1 & DS2 spectrum [17], 17 data points.
  - CHOOZ energy spectrum [18], 14 data points.
  - Palo-Verde total rate [19], 1 data point.
- ⇒ Double-Chooz FD-I (461 days) and FD-II (212 days) spectra [20], 54 data points.
- Daya-Bay 621-day spectrum [21], 36 data points.
  - Reno 800-day near & far total rates [22], 2 data points (with free normalization).
  - SBL reactor data (including Daya-Bay total flux at near detector), 77 data points [21, 23].

## Accelerator experiments

- MINOS  $10.71 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\nu_\mu$ -disappearance data [24], 39 data points.
  - MINOS  $3.36 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\bar{\nu}_\mu$ -disappearance data [24], 14 data points.
  - MINOS  $10.6 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\nu_e$ -appearance data [25], 5 data points.
  - MINOS  $3.3 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\bar{\nu}_e$ -appearance data [25], 5 data points.
  - T2K  $6.57 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\nu_\mu$ -disappearance data [26], 16 data points.
  - T2K  $6.57 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\nu_e$ -appearance data [27], 5 data points.
- ⇒ T2K  $4.01 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\bar{\nu}_\mu$ -disappearance data [28, 29], 63 data points.
- ⇒ T2K  $4.01 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\bar{\nu}_e$ -appearance data [30], 1 data point.
- ⇒ NO $\nu$ A  $2.74 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\nu_\mu$ -disappearance data [31], 18 data points.
- ⇒ NO $\nu$ A  $2.74 \times 10^{20}$  pot  $\nu_e$ -appearance data [32], 1 data point (both LEM and LID).

## Description of the $\chi^2$ data tables

We provide four gzip-compressed files, containing the  $\chi^2$  data tables for both Normal and Inverted Ordering of our global LEM and LID analyses. Each file is divided into 21 sections, identified by a unique tag and corresponding to a particular one- or two-dimensional projections. The tags and the meaning of the data columns for each section are listed below (note that  $\ell = 1$  for NO and  $\ell = 2$  for IO).

| $N^\circ$ | Section tag | 1 <sup>st</sup> column | 2 <sup>nd</sup> column                        | 3 <sup>rd</sup> column |
|-----------|-------------|------------------------|---|------------------------|
| 1         | # T13/T12   | $\sin^2 \theta_{13}$   | $\sin^2 \theta_{12}$                          | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 2         | # T13/DMS   | $\sin^2 \theta_{13}$   | $\log_{10}(\Delta m_{21}^2 / [\text{eV}^2])$  | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 3         | # T12/DMS   | $\sin^2 \theta_{12}$   | $\log_{10}(\Delta m_{21}^2 / [\text{eV}^2])$  | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 4         | # T13/T23   | $\sin^2 \theta_{13}$   | $\sin^2 \theta_{23}$                          | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 5         | # T13/DMA   | $\sin^2 \theta_{13}$   | $\Delta m_{3\ell}^2 / [10^{-3} \text{ eV}^2]$ | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 6         | # T23/DMA   | $\sin^2 \theta_{23}$   | $\Delta m_{3\ell}^2 / [10^{-3} \text{ eV}^2]$ | $\Delta\chi^2$         |

| $N^\circ$ | Section tag | 1 <sup>st</sup> column                        | 2 <sup>nd</sup> column                        | 3 <sup>rd</sup> column |
|-----------|-------------|---|---|------------------------|
| 7         | # T13/DCP   | $\sin^2 \theta_{13}$                          | $\delta_{\text{CP}} / [\text{deg}]$           | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 8         | # T23/DCP   | $\sin^2 \theta_{23}$                          | $\delta_{\text{CP}} / [\text{deg}]$           | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 9         | # DMA/DCP   | $\Delta m_{3\ell}^2 / [10^{-3} \text{ eV}^2]$ | $\delta_{\text{CP}} / [\text{deg}]$           | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 10        | # T12/T23   | $\sin^2 \theta_{12}$                          | $\sin^2 \theta_{23}$                          | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 11        | # T12/DCP   | $\sin^2 \theta_{12}$                          | $\delta_{\text{CP}} / [\text{deg}]$           | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 12        | # T12/DMA   | $\sin^2 \theta_{12}$                          | $\Delta m_{3\ell}^2 / [10^{-3} \text{ eV}^2]$ | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 13        | # DMS/T23   | $\log_{10}(\Delta m_{21}^2 / [\text{eV}^2])$  | $\sin^2 \theta_{23}$                          | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 14        | # DMS/DCP   | $\log_{10}(\Delta m_{21}^2 / [\text{eV}^2])$  | $\delta_{\text{CP}} / [\text{deg}]$           | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 15        | # DMS/DMA   | $\log_{10}(\Delta m_{21}^2 / [\text{eV}^2])$  | $\Delta m_{3\ell}^2 / [10^{-3} \text{ eV}^2]$ | $\Delta\chi^2$         |
| 16        | # T13       | $\sin^2 \theta_{13}$                          | $\Delta\chi^2$                                | —                      |
| 17        | # T12       | $\sin^2 \theta_{12}$                          | $\Delta\chi^2$                                | —                      |
| 18        | # T23       | $\sin^2 \theta_{23}$                          | $\Delta\chi^2$                                | —                      |
| 19        | # DCP       | $\delta_{\text{CP}} / [\text{deg}]$           | $\Delta\chi^2$                                | —                      |
| 20        | # DMS       | $\log_{10}(\Delta m_{21}^2 / [\text{eV}^2])$  | $\Delta\chi^2$                                | —                      |
| 21        | # DMA       | $\Delta m_{3\ell}^2 / [10^{-3} \text{ eV}^2]$ | $\Delta\chi^2$                                | —                      |

## References

- [1] M. C. Gonzalez-Garcia, M. Maltoni and T. Schwetz, *Updated fit to three neutrino mixing: status of leptonic CP violation*, *JHEP* **11** (2014) 052, [[1409.5439](#)].
- [2] I. Esteban, M. Gonzalez-Garcia, M. Maltoni, I. Martinez-Soler and T. Schwetz, “NuFIT 2.1 (2016).” <http://www.nu-fit.org>.
- [3] B. T. Cleveland et al., *Measurement of the solar electron neutrino flux with the Homestake chlorine detector*, *Astrophys. J.* **496** (1998) 505–526.
- [4] F. Kaether, W. Hampel, G. Heusser, J. Kiko and T. Kirsten, *Reanalysis of the GALLEX solar neutrino flux and source experiments*, *Phys. Lett.* **B685** (2010) 47–54, [[1001.2731](#)].
- [5] SAGE collaboration, J. N. Abdurashitov et al., *Measurement of the solar neutrino capture rate with gallium metal. III: Results for the 2002–2007 data-taking period*, *Phys. Rev.* **C80** (2009) 015807, [[0901.2200](#)].
- [6] SUPER-KAMIOKANDE collaboration, J. Hosaka et al., *Solar neutrino measurements in Super-Kamiokande-I*, *Phys. Rev.* **D73** (2006) 112001, [[hep-ex/0508053](#)].
- [7] SUPER-KAMIOKANDE collaboration, J. Cravens et al., *Solar neutrino measurements in Super-Kamiokande-II*, *Phys. Rev.* **D78** (2008) 032002, [[0803.4312](#)].
- [8] SUPER-KAMIOKANDE collaboration, K. Abe et al., *Solar neutrino results in Super-Kamiokande-III*, *Phys. Rev.* **D83** (2011) 052010, [[1010.0118](#)].
- [9] Y. Nakano,  *$^8\text{B}$  solar neutrino spectrum measurement using Super-Kamiokande IV*. PhD thesis, Tokyo U., 2016-02.
- [10] SNO collaboration, B. Aharmim et al., *Combined Analysis of all Three Phases of Solar Neutrino Data from the Sudbury Neutrino Observatory*, [1109.0763](#).
- [11] BOREXINO collaboration, G. Bellini et al., *Precision measurement of the  $^7\text{Be}$  solar neutrino interaction rate in Borexino*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **107** (2011) 141302, [[1104.1816](#)].

- [12] BOREXINO collaboration, G. Bellini et al., *Measurement of the solar  $8B$  neutrino rate with a liquid scintillator target and 3 MeV energy threshold in the Borexino detector*, *Phys. Rev. D* **82** (2010) 033006, [[0808.2868](#)].
- [13] BOREXINO collaboration, G. Bellini et al., *Neutrinos from the primary proton–proton fusion process in the Sun*, *Nature* **512** (2014) 383–386.
- [14] R. Wendell, “Atmospheric Results from Super-Kamiokande.” Talk given at the *XXVI International Conference on Neutrino Physics and Astrophysics*, Boston, USA, June 2–7, 2014.
- [15] ICECUBE collaboration, M. Aartsen et al., *Determining neutrino oscillation parameters from atmospheric muon neutrino disappearance with three years of IceCube DeepCore data*, *Phys. Rev. D* **91** (2015) 072004, [[1410.7227](#)].
- [16] ICECUBE collaboration, J. P. Yañez et al., “IceCube Oscillations: 3 years muon neutrino disappearance data.” [http://icecube.wisc.edu/science/data/nu\\_osc](http://icecube.wisc.edu/science/data/nu_osc).
- [17] KAMLAND collaboration, A. Gando et al., *Constraints on  $\theta_{13}$  from A Three-Flavor Oscillation Analysis of Reactor Antineutrinos at KamLAND*, *Phys. Rev. D* **83** (2011) 052002, [[1009.4771](#)].
- [18] CHOOZ collaboration, M. Apollonio et al., *Limits on Neutrino Oscillations from the CHOOZ Experiment*, *Phys. Lett. B* **466** (1999) 415–430, [[hep-ex/9907037](#)].
- [19] PALO VERDE collaboration, A. Piepke, *Final results from the Palo Verde neutrino oscillation experiment*, *Prog. Part. Nucl. Phys.* **48** (2002) 113–121.
- [20] M. Ishitsuka, “New results of Double Chooz.” Talk given at the Conference *Rencontres de Moriond EW 2016*, La Thuile, Italy, March 12–19, 2016.
- [21] C. Zhang, “Recent Results From Daya Bay.” Talk given at the *XXVI International Conference on Neutrino Physics and Astrophysics*, Boston, USA, June 2–7, 2014.
- [22] S.-H. Seo, “New Results from RENO.” Talk given at the *XXVI International Conference on Neutrino Physics and Astrophysics*, Boston, USA, June 2–7, 2014.
- [23] J. Kopp, P. A. N. Machado, M. Maltoni and T. Schwetz, *Sterile Neutrino Oscillations: The Global Picture*, *JHEP* **1305** (2013) 050, [[1303.3011](#)].
- [24] MINOS collaboration, P. Adamson et al., *Measurement of Neutrino and Antineutrino Oscillations Using Beam and Atmospheric Data in MINOS*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **110** (2013) 251801, [[1304.6335](#)].
- [25] MINOS collaboration, P. Adamson et al., *Electron neutrino and antineutrino appearance in the full MINOS data sample*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* (2013) , [[1301.4581](#)].
- [26] T2K collaboration, K. Abe et al., *Precise Measurement of the Neutrino Mixing Parameter  $\theta_{23}$  from Muon Neutrino Disappearance in an Off-axis Beam*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **112** (2014) 181801, [[1403.1532](#)].
- [27] T2K collaboration, K. Abe et al., *Observation of Electron Neutrino Appearance in a Muon Neutrino Beam*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **112** (2014) 061802, [[1311.4750](#)].
- [28] T2K collaboration, K. Abe et al., *Measurement of Muon Antineutrino Oscillations with an Accelerator-Produced Off-Axis Beam*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **116** (2016) 181801, [[1512.02495](#)].
- [29] S. Dennis, *Muon Antineutrino Disappearance and Non-standard Interactions at the T2K Experiment*. PhD thesis, Warwick U., 2015-10-24.

- [30] T2K collaboration, M. Ravonel Salzgeber, *Anti-neutrino oscillations with T2K*, *PoS EPS-HEP2015* (2015) 047.
- [31] NOvA collaboration, P. Adamson et al., *First measurement of muon-neutrino disappearance in NOvA*, *Phys. Rev. D* **93** (2016) 051104, [[1601.05037](#)].
- [32] NOvA collaboration, P. Adamson et al., *First measurement of electron neutrino appearance in NOvA*, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **116** (2016) 151806, [[1601.05022](#)].